

**Directions:** You may work to solve these problems in groups, but all written work must be your own. Unless the problem indicates otherwise, all problems require some justification; a correct answer without supporting reasoning is not sufficient. See “Guidelines and advice” on the course webpage for more information.

1. *Proof critiques.* Give a critique of each claimed proof below. A *proof critique* addresses the following questions: (1) Is the proof correct? (2) If correct, can the proof be improved in some way? (3) If incorrect, what is/are the error(s)? Can they be fixed, and if so, how?

- (a) **Theorem 1.** *If  $x$  and  $y$  are real numbers, then  $\frac{x+y}{2} \geq \sqrt{xy}$ .*

**Proof:**

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{x+y}{2} &\geq \sqrt{xy} \\ x+y &\geq 2\sqrt{xy} \\ (x+y)^2 &\geq 4xy \\ x^2+2xy+y^2 &\geq 4xy \\ x^2-2xy+y^2 &\geq 0 \\ (x-y)^2 &\geq 0\end{aligned}$$

□

- (b) **Theorem 2.** *All real numbers are equal.*

**Proof:** Let  $x$  and  $y$  be real numbers. Observe that

$$x^2 - y^2 = (x - y)(x + y) = x(x + y) - y(x + y).$$

After rearranging terms, this becomes  $x^2 - x(x + y) = y^2 - y(x + y)$ . Adding  $\frac{(x+y)^2}{4}$  to both sides gives  $x^2 - x(x+y) + \frac{(x+y)^2}{4} = y^2 - y(x+y) + \frac{(x+y)^2}{4}$ . Factoring both sides, we see that  $(x - \frac{x+y}{2})^2 = (y - \frac{x+y}{2})^2$  and taking the square root gives  $x - \frac{x+y}{2} = y - \frac{x+y}{2}$ . Adding  $\frac{x+y}{2}$  to both sides gives  $x = y$ . Since  $x$  and  $y$  were arbitrarily chosen real numbers, it follows that all real numbers are equal. □

- (c) **Theorem 3.** *If  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then  $n^2 = 3k$  or  $n^2 = 3k + 1$  for some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ .*

**Proof:** Suppose that  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ . By the division algorithm, it follows that  $n = 3q + r$  for some integers  $q$  and  $r$  with  $0 \leq r < 3$ . Since  $r$  is an integer and  $0 \leq r < 3$ , it follows that  $r \in \{0, 1, 2\}$ . We consider three cases, depending on the value of  $r$ .

Case 1: If  $r = 0$ , then  $n^2 = (3q + 0)^2 = 9q^2 = 3(3q^2)$ , and so  $n^2 = 3k$  when we set  $k$  equal to the integer  $3q^2$ .

Case 2: If  $r = 1$ , then  $n^2 = (3q + 1)^2 = 9q^2 + 6q + 1 = 3(3q^2 + 2q) + 1$ , and so  $n^2 = 3k + 1$  when we set  $k$  equal to the integer  $3q^2 + 2q$ .

Case 3: If  $r = 2$ , then  $n^2 = (3q + 2)^2 = 9q^2 + 12q + 4 = 3(3q^2 + 4q + 1) + 1$ , and so  $n^2 = 3k + 1$  when we set  $k$  equal to the integer  $3q^2 + 4q + 1$ .

In all cases, we have that  $n^2 = 3k$  or  $n^2 = 3k + 1$  for some integer  $k$ . □

- (d) **Theorem 4.** *Let  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ . If  $a \mid b$  and  $b \mid c$ , then  $a \mid c$ .*

**Proof:** Since  $a \mid b$ , we have that  $b = ka$  for some integer  $k$ . Similarly, since  $b \mid c$ , it follows that  $c = kb$  for some integer  $k$ . Therefore  $c = kb = k(ka) = k^2a$ . Since  $k^2$  is an integer, it follows that  $a \mid c$ .  $\square$

2. Prove that if  $x$  is an odd integer, then  $x^3$  is odd.
3. Prove that if  $x$  and  $y$  are integers and  $x$  is even, then  $xy$  is even.
4. Prove that if  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then  $5n^2 + 3n + 7$  is odd. Hint: try cases.
5. An integer  $p$  is *prime* if  $p \geq 2$  and the only positive divisors of  $p$  are 1 and  $p$ . Prove that if  $n$  is a positive integer,  $n \geq 2$ , and  $n$  is not prime, then  $2^n - 1$  is not prime.